



Historic Preservation Board Regular Meeting Minutes

August 14, 2024 at 9:00 AM

City Hall Commission Chambers
401 S. Park Avenue

Present

Fay Pappas, Aimee Spencer, Kelsey Wolfe, John Skolfield, Wade Miller, N. Lee Rambeau, Kim Burst Wood

Absent

None

Staff Present

Director of Planning & Zoning Allison McGillis, Planning Consultant Jeff Briggs, Administrative Coordinator Mary Bush

1. Call to Order

Chairman Miller called the meeting to order at 9:03 a.m.

2. Consent Agenda

- a. Approve the minutes of July 10, 2024.

Motion made by John Skolfield, seconded by N. Lee Rambeau, to approve the July 10, 2024 meeting minutes.

The motion carried unanimously by a 5-0 vote. (Fay Pappas and Kim Burstwood were not present for the meeting minutes.)

3. Public Comments (for items not on the agenda): Three minutes allowed for each speaker

The Board heard public comment from the following resident:

Michael Perelman of 1010 Greentree Drive, Winter Park, FL 32789. Mr. Perelman asked the Board to consider removing an element of the historic preservation code that allows for an applicant to tear down a historically designated home, build a new home of a different style, and keep the historic designation.

No one else from the public wished to speak. The public hearing was closed.

4. Public Hearings (Public participation and comment on these matters must be in person.)

- a. Certificate of Review for additions to the house at 151 Stirling Avenue, inclusive of variances within the Virginia Heights, East historic district.

Mr. Briggs provided a summary of the item. He noted that the applicant had revised their original conceptual plans to accommodate the recommendations that they received by the Board at their preliminary review hearing on July 10, 2024. Mr. Briggs indicated that the applicant had reduced the living area of their proposed one-story addition to the rear of the house, which eliminated two of the initial requested variances. He added that the proposed porch and pool deck would be placed at the very end of the house. He noted that the only variances that were being requested were for the east-side setback and the street-side setback adjacent to the pool. He then noted that a significantly dense and tall viburnum hedge would be installed along the property line on College Point for privacy and to screen the view of the pool and a significant amount of the porch and house addition. He also noted that the architectural details of the addition would match the existing house. Mr. Briggs then explained that the existing house is a “non-contributing” structure, built in 1960, but the request is significant in maintaining its height and scale, which is compatible with many of the “contributing” structures in the historic district.

Staff recommendation was for approval with the following condition:

- a 5 or 6-foot-tall viburnum hedge must be installed along College Point.

The Board inquired about whether a viburnum hedge is the only option for the privacy hedge and asked for clarification regarding the visibility of the addition's roof ridge.

The applicant's architect, Dave Reynolds addressed the Board and noted that the only fenestration involved in the project would be the double doors on the master bedroom.

The Board expressed favor of the project and felt that it matched the size and scale of the neighborhood. The Board recommended that the applicant consider historically designating the house and that it be considered as a contributing structure.

The Board briefly explained how to apply for historic designation of the home and what benefits it would provide for the applicant and the community.

Motion made by Aimee Spencer, seconded by Kelsey Wolfe to approve additions to the house at 151 Stirling Avenue, inclusive of variances within the Virginia Heights, East historic district, with the following condition:

- **a 5 or 6-foot-tall viburnum hedge must be installed along College Point.**

The motion carried unanimously by a 7-0 vote.

- b. Certificate of Review to add a second floor to the accessory building at 118 W. Comstock Avenue, built in 1935.

Mr. Briggs noted that Historic Preservation Board member John Skolfield was the applicant, so Mr. Skolfield recused himself from the Board's purview on the item.

Mr. Briggs provided a summary of the item. He noted that the applicant had discussed the item and received recommendations from the Board at their preliminary review hearing on July 10, 2024. He then indicated that a solid wall of the adjacent two-story structure of Miller's Hardware faced the applicant's structure three and a half feet away. He also indicated that the applicant had provided the building permit details for the project, which included the exterior materials and elevation notes for the addition. He went on to note that there would be two sides of the applicant's building that would not be visible to the public and would be built with hardie board, while the visible sides would be built with real wood.

Staff recommendation was for approval.

The Board inquired about the material that would be used for the trim and siding for the addition.

The applicant, John Skolfield of 118 W. Comstock Avenue, Winter Park, FL 32789 addressed the Board. Mr. Skolfield went over the materials that would be used for the addition. He noted that he would be using 3/4-inch composite trim boards, cellular PVC for corner trim, and cedar wood for siding. He also noted that he would be matching the architecture of the main house on the addition.

Motion made by Wade Miller, seconded by N. Lee Rambeau, to approve adding a second floor to the accessory building at 118 W. Comstock Avenue, built in 1935.

The motion carried unanimously by a 7-0 vote.

5. Action Items

- a. Request for Preliminary Review for additions to the house at 1500 Sunset Drive, inclusive of variances, subject to historic designation.

Mr. Briggs provided a summary of the item. He explained that the applicant wanted to

increase the square footage of the existing house without building the added square footage as a second story. He further explained that to do so, the proposed additions would need to extend into the setbacks, creating a need for four variances. He then noted that the variances would involve extending the existing one-car carport to create a two-car carport, extending the house toward the interior lot line with the adjacent neighbor at 1510 Sunset Drive, extending the house toward the Edgewater Avenue street side, and creating a four-foot privacy wall on the Wilbar Circle street side. Mr. Briggs then indicated that the applicant wanted to keep the one-story mid-century modern style of the existing house and that the request would be subject to a historic designation.

The applicant, Shane Williams at 1333 Alberta Avenue, Winter Park, FL 32789 addressed the Board. Mr. Williams discussed what could be built if the existing home was torn down. He then reviewed the elevations for the project and noted that the rear patio was pulled back from Wilbar Circle to create a smaller encroachment. He also noted that the project was below the required floor-area-ratio and impervious lot coverage maximums.

The Board inquired about relocation of the sidewalk on Edge Water Avenue, how much the side setback would change, and who would pay for the cost. A brief discussion ensued regarding the setback to the adjacent neighbor and how the proposed house would fit with the aesthetic of the neighborhood. The Board expressed favor of the project and a desire to have the proposed sidewalk stay straight lined. The Board then discussed the applicant using walls from the existing house and whether comments from the neighbors had been received.

Mr. Briggs emphasized that the project was subject to historic designation. A brief discussion ensued on the importance and benefits of historically designating properties. The Board then expressed their favor of the project and its design details.

b. Historic Preservation Procedures

Mr. Briggs provided a summary of the item. He noted that at the last Board meeting on July 10, 2024, the Board had begun discussion regarding amending the city's historic preservation ordinance to help make progress on solving issues with unauthorized demolitions and provide direction on how to address them in the future. He added that the Board's recommended process of having a preliminary review and then a final review for applications has proven beneficial to pointing applicants in the right direction with their projects. He then indicated that the Board had also discussed making a requirement that building permits for historic preservation applications go back to the Historic Preservation Board for a compliance review to ensure that applicants have included a list of the correct exterior materials or have called them out in their plans in lieu of any notations. Mr. Briggs noted that staff would work on draft language to codify this requirement. He then briefly discussed previous applications that had

violations regarding following code and Board approvals. He also explained the authority of the Code Enforcement Board and the Historic Preservation Board with regard to the violations.

The Board then discussed the types of penalties that could be used for unauthorized demolitions and the process for creating and enforcing them. They expressed that they wanted the penalties to be egregious enough to deter builders and applicants from making intentional violations but with available discretion for violations deemed non-intentional. They also wanted to establish clear procedures and penalties that would not be affected by any bias. A brief discussion then ensued regarding having a contracted architect with the city to review the plans for each project and dealing with intentional neglect of historic houses.

The Board inquired and Mr. Briggs responded that the next step would be for staff to come up with a draft of the amendment text for the ordinance for the Board to review.

6. Non-Action Items

7. Staff Updates

8. Board Comments

The Board indicated that they wanted staff to provide an updated survey of contributing structures within the city and to make it a regularly scheduled update.

9. Upcoming Agenda Items

10. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:54 a.m.

Minutes approved by the Board on September 25, 2024.

ATTEST:

/s/ Mary Bush, Recording Secretary